

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

**Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP)  
Community Steering Committee Meeting #36**

August 26, 2024

# Welcome

**Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead**

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**

# Agenda

TIME	TOPIC
5:30 PM	Welcome, Meeting Logistics, Agenda
5:45 PM	Approval of Meeting Minutes from June 24, 2024 (Action Item)
5:50 PM	Fuel Refining Ad Hoc Update
5:55 PM	CSC Leads Ongoing Updates
6:00 PM	Overview of Implementation Framework
6:30 PM	Breakout Activity Part 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Introduction to Activity</li><li>• Prioritizing Actions</li></ul>
6:50 PM	Break
7:00 PM	Breakout Activity Part 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Report Back</li><li>• Small Group Discussion</li></ul>
7:25 PM	Next Steps/Meeting Details
7:30 PM	Public Comment on Non-Agenda Item Matters/Meeting Close

# Tips for Participants for a Successful Hybrid Meeting

- **Raise your hand** to speak, physically or virtually.
- **Say your name before speaking** so that virtual participants know who is speaking.
- **Speak one at a time** – overlapping conversations are difficult for online participants to hear.
- **Mute microphone** unless speaking to minimize background noise.
- **Avoid side conversations** or other background noise.
- **Share video** if you are joining virtually so we can stay visually connected.
- **Technology happens** – please be flexible and patient.
- **Use the zoom chat or raised hand function** if unable to hear participants.

# Path To Clean Air Meeting Agreements

## Member expectations:

- **One mic, one voice:** If in person, raise your hand to speak. If on Zoom, use Raised Hand function under Reactions at the bottom of your screen.
- Be respectful and open to other points of view.
- Review all materials prior to the meeting.
- Take care of yourself (Stretch, drink water and breathe).
- ‘Popcorning’ or passing the mic method will be used to encourage participation amongst quieter CSC members.





## Meeting procedures:

- Begin each meeting by taking roll call to establish a quorum.
- Ask for public comment before taking any action.
- Any member can make a motion which then has to be seconded by another member.
- Co-Leads adjourn.

# Meeting Goals

<b>Goal 1</b>	Approve June 24, 2024 Meeting Minutes.
<b>Goal 2</b>	CSC members will receive a presentation from Air District staff covering the “Overview of Implementation Framework” and review the 22 “Started” (In progress) actions.
<b>Goal 3</b>	CSC members will convene in Breakout Activity (Part I) to complete a Prioritization Exercise and choose 10 actions to prioritize for year one of implementation.
<b>Goal 4</b>	Air District staff will tally all actions and present a recap of the the top 10 actions.
<b>Goal 5</b>	CSC members will convene in Breakout Activity (Part II) and partake in small group discussions to share ideas on how to implement these actions.

# Where are We Today?

		2024									
Phase	Work Product	Mar	April	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec
 <b>SCOPE AND ORGANIZE</b> PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY	Steering Committee (CSC)										
	Leadership Committee										
	Subcommittees (Ad Hoc or Standing)										
 <b>COMMUNITY OUTREACH</b>	Community Education										
	Community Outreach										
	Community Engagement										
 <b>PLAN</b> REVIEW & ADOPT	Plan Adoption - CSC	☑									
	Plan Adoption - BAAQMD			☑							
	Plan Adoption - CARB						?				
	Translate Final Plan					☑					
 <b>IMPLEMENT</b> SHARED COMMITMENT TO ACTION	Pre-Implementation										
	Implementation Plan								☑		
	Implementation Activities										
	Annual Progress Report								☑		

☑ Major Milestone

# Approval of June 24, 2024 Meeting Minutes

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead





# Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Committee Updates Fuel Refining Ad Hoc

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead

BK White, CSC Member

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

# Fuel Refining Ad Hoc Update

- Bi-Monthly Meeting Air District and Refinery Community Groups
  - Kick-Off Meeting took place on July 24, 2024.

# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# CSC Leads Ongoing Updates

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Ongoing Updates from Leads

- **July Social Gathering Recap**
  - CSC members met on Monday, 07/29 and had a potluck.
- **CSC Membership Recruitment for Government and Industry Reps**
  - Vacancies: Contra Costa County Health Representative, Contra Costa County Planning Rep



# Ongoing Updates from Leads (Cont.)

- **CSC Membership Attendance**

- Count and track absences from August 2024 after new Charter was adopted and new Leads completed onboarding.
- As part of Charter, Leads will meet with members who have missed more than 3 CSC meetings within a 12-month period to assess their capacity to serve as a CSC member (Section 4.4.2 CSC Membership Engagement).
- Leads will start having discussions with members who have missed 2 meetings.



# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Overview of Implementation Framework

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead

Diana Ruiz, BAAQMD

Laura Cackette, BAAQMD



RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**

# Overview of Implementation Framework

**Goal:** Create a plan for year one of implementation (Year 1: 2025) that covers the key actions that the CSC, Co-Leads, Air District and other public agencies will carry out.

The year one implementation plan will cover October 2024 - September 2025.

The following information was used to sort all actions in the Plan into five categories:

- Referenced Appendix A of the PTCA Plan
- Information gleaned from Air District internal kick-off meetings with BAAQMD Divisions
- Considered knowledge based on activities and conversations within Air District Leadership

# Overview of Implementation Framework (Cont.)

## Why is a framework needed?

- To establish a mutually agreed upon approach for co-developing with the Leads and CSC the list of actions to be implemented in year one.
- The PTCA Plan includes 31 strategies and over 140 actions with subactions - given the number of actions, it necessitates a framework to efficiently move into implementation.
- A framework also allows the CSC to prioritize and reach consensus regarding actions to include in year one implementation.

# Five Categories of Actions

## Actions to be included in Year One Implementation Plan:

### Ongoing

- 15 actions that represent re-occurring work of the Air District and/or CARB.
- These actions will be ongoing during implementation and do not necessarily have a clear start and end date.
- Actions that the Air District is routinely undertaking on an ongoing basis.

# Five Categories of Actions

## Actions to be included in Year One Implementation Plan:

### Reporting

- 13 actions that include requirements to provide periodic reporting (i.e., quarterly reports, annual report and status updates).
- These set of actions outline the information to be communicated and frequency of reporting. Some actions call for progress updates where needed.

# Five Categories of Actions (Cont.)

## Actions to be discussed for inclusion in Year One Implementation Plan:

### Started (In progress)

- 22 actions are already in motion (i.e., in progress).
- As part of the implementation framework, CSC will convene in a Prioritization Exercise to choose 10 actions to prioritize for Year One of implementation.



# Five Categories of Actions (Cont.)

**Actions to be discussed for inclusion in Year One Implementation Plan:**

## **CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator**

- 8 actions where the CSC is the lead initiator of the action as stated in the Plan.
- As part of the implementation framework, we will introduce the CSC Lead Implementer / Initiator actions at the upcoming Sept. CSC meeting.

# Five Categories of Actions (Cont.)

## Actions that need further discussion:

### Not Yet Started

- This grouping represents an extensive number of actions that are pending initiation. Some actions will need to be separated into subactions to assign appropriate implementer.
- Air District staff recommends the CSC discuss the 8 “Not Yet Started” actions that have a specific start date in 2024 or 2025 at the September CSC.
- The remainder of the “Not Yet Started” actions are recommended for further discussion during the year. These actions will not be included in the year one implementation plan.

# Commercial and Industrial Sources (C&I) - 4 “Started” Actions

## 1 Action: Control Fugitive Dust

<b>C&amp;I 1.1</b>	Dust White Paper (Identify Best Management Practices, evaluate Rule Development opportunities, and implement recommendations)
--------------------	---

## 3 Actions: Large Industrial Sources

<b>C&amp;I 4.1</b>	Implement Rule 11-18 at Large Facilities (Non-Fuel Refining) - consult with CSC on HRAs, any Risk Reduction Plans (RRPs), and provide implementation status reports
--------------------	---

<b>C&amp;I 4.4</b>	West Contra Costa County Landfill: Implement Rule 11-18 and Conduct Gap Analysis
--------------------	--

<b>C&amp;I 4.5</b>	Metal Recycling (Sims, Pick ‘n Pull): Source Evaluation and Metals White Paper
--------------------	--

# Fuel Refining - 14 “Started” Actions

## 5 Actions: Reduce Persistent Flaring and Improve Incident Response

<b>FR 2.1</b>	BAAQMD + CSC work w/ City of Richmond to strengthen the ISO
<b>FR 2.2</b>	BAAQMD coordinate with CSC to improve and expand communications about all flaring events and also for major incidents at both fuel-refining and non-fuel refining sources
<b>FR 2.2(A)</b>	Improve and expand communications via creation of a new webpage
<b>FR 2.2(B)</b>	Improve and expand communications via standardized internal and external communication protocols
<b>FR 2.4</b>	BAAQMD will improve incident response program to get more transparent and user-friendly information to a wider audience faster during and after major incidents

# Fuel Refining - 14 “Started” Actions (cont’d)

## 4 Actions: Hold Polluters Accountable

<b>FR 3.5</b>	BAAQMD expedite the Notice of Violations resolutions process in the fuel refining sector
<b>FR 3.10</b>	BAAQMD will develop, by 2026, a program to apply a Title VI/Gov Code section 11135 lens for applying a civil rights/disparate impact analysis of refinery-related permitting activities
<b>FR 3.13</b>	Improve refinery fenceline and community air monitoring programs
<b>FR 3.15</b>	Refinery-related measurement data accessibility improvements

# Fuel Refining - 14 “Started” Actions (cont’d)

## 3 Actions: Reduce Exposure from Toxics

<b>FR 4.1</b>	Amend Rule 11-18 to improve stringency, efficiency, transparency, and public engagement
<b>FR 4.2</b>	Prioritize implementation of Rule 11-18 for Chevron
<b>FR 4.3</b>	Implement 11-18 at Chemtrade

## 2 Actions: Reduce Exposure from PM and Other Criteria Air Pollutants

<b>FR 5.1</b>	Implement Rule 6-5 Settlement Agreement
<b>FR 5.2</b>	Finalize PM2.5 Local Risk Methodology for rule development and accountability

# Health, Mobile, + Resources - 4 “Started” Actions

## 1 Action: Health - Reduce Air Pollution at Home

<b>H 2.5</b>	Reduce exposure to wood burning: Evaluate rule development opportunities. Initiate by the end of 2024.
--------------	--

## 2 Actions: Mobile - Truck-Attracting Businesses

<b>Mobile 1.2</b>	Model Policy/Ordinance for Low to Zero Emission Operations
-------------------	--

<b>Mobile 1.4</b>	Evaluate Magnet/Indirect Source Rule: Track SCAQMD’s Indirect Source Regulations and various local ordinances, looking for opportunities to develop Bay Area specific models and regulations
-------------------	--

## 1 Action: Resource PTCA Plan Implementation

<b>R 1.2</b>	Co-develop and implement an annual implementation plan
--------------	--

# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead





# Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Breakout Activity: Prioritization Exercise

Nina Garde, BAAQMD

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**

# Breakout Session Overview

- **Prioritization Exercise**

- CSC members will choose the top 10 actions to prioritize out of the 22 “Started” (In Progress) actions.
- Top 10 actions will help inform the PTCA Implementation Plan and CSC’s level of engagement.
- Prioritize actions where you want to place maximum effort.
- All 22 actions (even the 12 not selected today) are moving into Implementation phase.

- **Goal for Breakout Activity**

- Utilize dot voting for the Prioritization Exercise.
- CSC members will go through all 22 “Started” (In Progress) actions.
- CSC members will choose 10 actions to prioritize for year one implementation.
- Air District staff will tally all actions and show the top 10 actions chosen.

# Instructions for Prioritization Exercise

- **In Person Group:**
  - In-person members will receive 10 colored stickers to choose their top 10 actions.
  - Visit all 3 substations and place your sticker on the action you want to prioritize.
- **Virtual Group:**
  - Online members will have virtual colored dots to choose their top 10 actions.
  - Go through the “virtual” substations and paste your dot on the action you want to prioritize.
- **Helpful tips:**
  - Reference pre-read document as you go through the exercise.
  - In general please ask questions of your fellow CSC members and staff as needed.

# Prioritization Exercise (15 minutes)

- All CSC members will have 15 minutes to choose their top 10 actions.
- Substations are split into 3 areas (by Community Concern):
  - **Substation 1:** Commercial and Industrial (C&I) (4 actions)
  - **Substation 2:** Fuel Refining (14 actions)
  - **Substation 3:** Health, Mobile, Resource PTCA Implementation Strategy (4 actions)
- Use only one sticker per action.

# Break (10 minutes)

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR

# Outcome of Prioritization Exercise

Karissa White, BAAQMD

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY

PATH TO

CLEAN AIR



# Breakout Activity: Small Group Discussion

Karissa White, BAAQMD

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**



# Breakout Session Overview

- **Small Group Discussion**

- CSC members will breakout into groups and discuss the 10 prioritized actions.
- Two (2) Breakout groups: one virtual and one in-person.

- **Goal for Breakout Activity**

- Discuss and engage with each other about what the top 10 actions mean for each of you.
- Share why you chose the action(s) for the Prioritization Exercise.
- Ask questions and share thoughts!

# Small Group Discussion (20-25 minutes)

## Prompts:

- Do these top 10 actions align with the actions you chose?
  - If they don't align, please tell us more.
- How do you see yourself participating in the implementation of these top 10 actions?

# Steering Committee Questions and Discussions

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Public Comment

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead



# Next Meeting Details

- **Monday, September 23rd, 2024**
  - Time: 5:30 - 7:30 PM
  - On-site Location: Richmond HQE
    - 4114 Lakeside Dr. Richmond CA 94806
  - Online: Zoom (link provided in the coming weeks)

# Public Comment on Non-Agenda Matters

Dr. Niyi Omotoso, CSC Co-Lead

RICHMOND - NORTH  
RICHMOND - SAN PABLO  
COMMUNITY **PATH TO**  
**CLEAN AIR**