



BAY AREA  
AIR QUALITY  
MANAGEMENT  
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS  
STATIONARY SOURCE COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

JOHN GIOIA - CHAIR  
DAVID CANEPA  
SCOTT HAGGERTY  
KAREN MITCHOFF  
BRAD WAGENKNECHT

ROD SINKS – VICE CHAIR  
CAROLE GROOM  
NATE MILEY  
JIM SPERING

**MONDAY  
DECEMBER 18, 2017  
10:30 A.M.**

**1<sup>ST</sup> FLOOR BOARD ROOM  
375 BEALE STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105**

**AGENDA**

**1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL – PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

*The Committee Chair shall call the meeting to order and the Clerk of the Boards shall take roll of the Committee members. The Committee Chair shall lead the Pledge of Allegiance.*

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

*(Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at District headquarters, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA, 94105 at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.*

*This meeting will be webcast. To see the webcast, please visit <http://www.baaqmd.gov/about-the-air-district/board-of-directors/resolutionsagendasminutes> at the time of the meeting.*

**Staff/Phone (415) 749-**

**3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 18, 2017**

**Clerk of the Boards/5073**

*The Committee will consider approving the draft minutes of the Stationary Source Committee meeting of September 18, 2017.*

4. **RULE DEVELOPMENT ADDRESSING PARTICULATE MATTER**

**J. Broadbent/5052**  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*Staff will present an overview of rule development addressing particulate matter.*

5. **REGULATION 11, RULE 18 IMPLEMENTATION UPDATE**

**J. Broadbent/5052**  
[jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov](mailto:jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov)

*The Committee will receive an update regarding initial implementation of Regulation 11, Rule 18.*

6. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

*Any member of the Board, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)*

7. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

*Monday, February 19, 2018, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 10:30 a.m.*

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

*The Committee meeting shall be adjourned by the Committee Chair.*

**CONTACT:**

**MANAGER, EXECUTIVE OPERATIONS**  
**375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94105**  
[mmartinez@baaqmd.gov](mailto:mmartinez@baaqmd.gov)

**(415) 749-5016**  
**FAX: (415) 928-8560**  
**BAAQMD homepage:**  
[www.baaqmd.gov](http://www.baaqmd.gov)

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting. Please note that all correspondence must be addressed to the “Stationary Source Committee” and received at least 24 hours prior, excluding weekends and holidays, in order to be presented at that Board meeting. Any correspondence received after that time will be presented to the Board at the following meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- Any writing relating to an open session item on this Agenda that is distributed to all, or a majority of all, members of the body to which this Agenda relates shall be made available at the District’s offices at 375 Beale Street, Suite 600, San Francisco, CA 94105, at the time such writing is made available to all, or a majority of all, members of that body.

**Accessibility and Non-Discrimination Policy**

The Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) does not discriminate on the basis of race, national origin, ethnic group identification, ancestry, religion, age, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, color, genetic information, medical condition, or mental or physical disability, or any other attribute or belief protected by law.

It is the Air District’s policy to provide fair and equal access to the benefits of a program or activity administered by Air District. The Air District will not tolerate discrimination against any person(s) seeking to participate in, or receive the benefits of, any program or activity offered or conducted by the Air District. Members of the public who believe they or others were unlawfully denied full and equal access to an Air District program or activity may file a discrimination complaint under this policy. This non-discrimination policy also applies to other people or entities affiliated with Air District, including contractors or grantees that the Air District utilizes to provide benefits and services to members of the public.

Auxiliary aids and services including, for example, qualified interpreters and/or listening devices, to individuals who are deaf or hard of hearing, and to other individuals as necessary to ensure effective communication or an equal opportunity to participate fully in the benefits, activities, programs and services will be provided by the Air District in a timely manner and in such a way as to protect the privacy and independence of the individual. Please contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below at least three days in advance of a meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

If you believe discrimination has occurred with respect to an Air District program or activity, you may contact the Non-Discrimination Coordinator identified below or visit our website at [www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility](http://www.baaqmd.gov/accessibility) to learn how and where to file a complaint of discrimination.

Questions regarding this Policy should be directed to the Air District’s Non-Discrimination Coordinator, Rex Sanders, at (415) 749-4951 or by email at [rsanders@baaqmd.gov](mailto:rsanders@baaqmd.gov).

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94105  
FOR QUESTIONS PLEASE CALL (415) 749-5016 or (415) 749-4941**

**EXECUTIVE OFFICE:  
MONTHLY CALENDAR OF AIR DISTRICT MEETINGS**

**DECEMBER 2017**

<b><u>TYPE OF MEETING</u></b>	<b><u>DAY</u></b>	<b><u>DATE</u></b>	<b><u>TIME</u></b>	<b><u>ROOM</u></b>
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	<b>Thursday</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>9:30 a.m.</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room</b>
<b>Board of Directors Personnel Committee</b> <i>(At the Call of the Chair)</i>	<b>Monday</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>9:30 a.m.</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room</b>
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i>	<b>Monday</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>10:30 a.m.</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room</b>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	<b>Wednesday</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>9:45 a.m.</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room</b>
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month</i> - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 2017 AT 10:30 A.M.	<b>Wednesday</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>9:30 a.m.</b>	<b>1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109</b>
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED AND RESCHEDULED TO THURSDAY, DECEMBER 7, 2017 AT 9:30 A.M.	<b>Thursday</b>	<b>28</b>	<b>9:30 a.m.</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room</b>

# JANUARY 2018

<u>TYPE OF MEETING</u>	<u>DAY</u>	<u>DATE</u>	<u>TIME</u>	<u>ROOM</u>
<b>Board of Directors Regular Meeting</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Wednesday	3	9:45 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Executive Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	15	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Stationary Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Monday of each Month)</i> - CANCELLED	Monday	15	10:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Regular Mtg. / Retreat</b> <i>(Meets on the 1<sup>st</sup> &amp; 3<sup>rd</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	17	9:45 a.m.	Dougherty Station Community Center 17011 Bollinger Canyon Rd, San Ramon, CA 94582
<b>Board of Directors Climate Protection Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday of every other Month)</i>	Thursday	18	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room
<b>Board of Directors Budget &amp; Finance Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Wednesday of each Month)</i>	Wednesday	24	9:30 a.m.	1st Floor, Yerba Buena Room #109
<b>Board of Directors Mobile Source Committee</b> <i>(Meets on the 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday of each Month)</i>	Thursday	25	9:30 a.m.	1 <sup>st</sup> Floor Board Room

AG – 12/11/17 – 4:42 pm.

G/Board/Executive Office/Moncal

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Gioia and Members  
of the Stationary Source Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 8, 2017

Re: Approval of the Minutes of September 18, 2017

---

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Approve the attached draft minutes of the Stationary Source Committee (Committee) meeting of September 18, 2017.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the Committee meeting of September 18, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Marcy Hiratzka  
Reviewed by: Maricela Martinez

Attachment 3A: Draft Minutes of the Committee Meeting of September 18, 2017

## AGENDA: 3A – ATTACHMENT

Draft Minutes – Stationary Source Committee Meeting of September 18, 2017

Bay Area Air Quality Management District

375 Beale Street, Suite 600  
San Francisco, California 94105  
(415) 749-5073

### **DRAFT MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Stationary Source Committee Meeting  
Monday, September 18, 2017

#### **1. CALL TO ORDER – ROLL CALL**

Stationary Source Committee (Committee) Chairperson John Gioia called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m.

Present: Committee Chairperson John Gioia; Vice Chairperson Rod Sinks; and Directors David Canepa, Carole Groom, Scott Haggerty, Nate Miley, and Brad Wagenknecht.

Absent: Directors Karen Mitchoff and Jim Spring.

Also Present: None.

#### **2. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS**

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area; Bob Harlow, Mill Valley Community Action Network; Jan Warren, Interfaith Climate Action Network of Contra Costa County; Steve Nadel, Sunflower Alliance; and Marcie Keever, Friends of the Earth.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Haggerty was noted present at 9:39 a.m.

#### **3. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF APRIL 17, 2017**

Public Comments:

No requests received.

Committee Comments:

None.

Committee Action:

Director Canepa made a motion, seconded by Director Haggerty, to approve the Minutes of April 17, 2017; and the motion carried by the following vote of the Committee:

AYES: Canepa, Gioia, Groom, Haggerty, Sinks, and Wagenknecht.

NOES: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.  
ABSENT: Miley, Mitchoff, and Spering.

#### **4. UPDATE ON WOOD SMOKE PROGRAM**

Jean Roggenkamp, Deputy Executive Officer, introduced Wayne Kino, Director of Compliance and Enforcement, who gave the staff presentation *Update on Wood Smoke Program* including: Winter Particulate Matter (PM)<sub>2.5</sub> seasons; wood smoke enforcement; enforcement highlights; Winter Spare the Air campaign; outreach map; Wood Smoke Reduction Incentive Program; program results; and next steps.

##### Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; and Richard Gray, 350 Bay Area.

##### Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed the need for the District to improve its outreach strategies and investigate why targeted outreach in highly-impacted areas has not yielded the anticipated number of grant applications in those areas; past and current efforts to reduce wood burning in the San Geronimo Valley; whether the rising cost of contractors will contribute to the potential need to increase the program incentives; the District's response to the Russian consulate's recent burning activity; the concern of repurposing the remaining funds from this cycle, which may impact the program's momentum, and the sources upon which the District plans to draw for future cycles; the sporting arenas in which the District advertises this program; factors contributing to the difficulty of identifying potential violations; the request for a map indicating areas that have yet to be targeted for this program, grant updates, and marketing efforts; the distinction between *local production* and the *regional transport* of wood smoke, and the feasibility of the District investing in lighting or heat-sensory equipment that would make it easier to detect wood-burning homes in areas where the visibility is poor.

##### Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

NOTED PRESENT: Director Miley was noted present at 10:00 a.m.

#### **5. UPDATE ON DRAFT REGULATION 11, RULE 18: REDUCTION OF RISK FROM AIR TOXIC EMISSIONS AT EXISTING FACILITIES**

Damian Breen, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer, introduced Jaime Williams, Director of Engineering and Information Technology, who gave the staff presentation *Draft Regulation 11, Rule 18: Reduction Of Risk From Air Toxic Emissions At Existing Facilities*, including: toxic air contaminants (TAC); key risk and impact measures; effectiveness of control programs; TAC stationary source control programs; Draft Rule 11-18 overview; new risk action thresholds; Draft Rule 11-18 scope; implementation: risk characterization and risk reduction; public engagement; and next steps.

Public Comments:

Public comments were given by Bill Quinn, California Council for Environmental and Economic Balance; Janet Stromberg, 350 Bay Area; Bob Brown, Western States Petroleum Association; and Charles Davidson, Sunflower Alliance.

Committee Comments:

The Committee and staff discussed how the District prioritizes the scores of impacted facilities, and how the District justifies its proposed exemptions; the need for the District to publicly make the distinction between the originally estimated number of impacted facilities and the updated (decreased) amount of impacted facilities, brought about by exemptions and subsequent additional rulemakings; the request for the list of impacted facilities, broken down by phase, county, and city; the suggestion of moving government facilities currently in Phase 2 to Phase 1, to make government agencies lead businesses by example; Draft Rule 11-18's adoption and implementation schedule; how the District plans to evaluate the impacted facilities' proposed risk reduction measures; the request for language addressing impacted facilities that can be added to County websites; when the Draft Rule's socioeconomic report is expected to be published; the Committee's desire to prioritize cement plants; the need for additional engineering staff; PM reduction efforts that will be covered in future District regulations in conjunction with the Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment, as Draft Rule 11-18 only focuses on diesel PM; and available options for cleaner generators, and technologies that will replace diesel engines in the future.

Committee Action:

None; receive and file.

**6. COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS**

None.

**7. TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING**

Monday, November 20, 2017, Bay Area Air Quality Management District Office, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, California 94105 at 10:30 a.m.

**8. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 11:44 a.m.

Marcy Hiratzka  
Clerk of the Boards

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Gioia and Members  
of the Stationary Source Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 8, 2017

Re: Rule Development Addressing Particulate Matter

---

**RECOMMENDED ACTION**

None; receive and file.

**BACKGROUND**

The Bay Area is not yet in attainment of state standards for particles smaller than 10 microns (PM<sub>10</sub>), or particles smaller than 2.5 micrometers (PM<sub>2.5</sub>). Small particles cause or contribute to a wide variety of serious health problems, including asthma, bronchitis, cardio-vascular diseases, and cancer as a result of its non-attainment status, the region must implement all feasible measures to reduce particulate emissions. Stationary Source Measure 31 in the 2017 Clean Air Plan suggested review of the Regulation 6, Rule 1 (Rule 6-1) particulate matter (PM) emissions requirements. The Air District is considering amendments to Rule 6-1 to further reduce particulate matter emissions in the Bay Area. The Air District is also considering new rules under Regulation 6 that address different types of particulate matter emissions.

**DISCUSSION**

The draft amendments to Rule 6-1 address a commitment by the Air District's Board of Directors to review Stationary Source Measure SS-31 in the Air District's 2017 Clean Air Plan. Background on the Bay Area's particulate matter challenges are documented in a November 2012 staff report entitled *Understanding Particulate Matter: Protecting Public Health in the San Francisco Bay Area*. These draft amendments to Rule 6-1 are the next of many steps needed to reduce particulate matter emissions and improve public health.

Draft amendments to Rule 6-1 include:

- Clarify exemptions for particulates from operations covered by other existing Air District rules, and for sugar and salt manufacturing,
- Prohibition of visible emissions within and from bulk material storage and handling facilities,
- Update particulate emissions limits from general sources (both concentration and mass emission limits) to reflect the most stringent levels achievable, and

- Clarify testing requirements to determine compliance.

Staff proposes draft amendments to Rule 6-1 because its particulate standards have not been updated in decades; other air districts in California have more stringent standards, and amendments are needed to ensure the Bay Area standards are health-protective; control technology is available that facilities can use to comply at a reasonable cost; and the revised standards will obtain PM<sub>2.5</sub> reductions that will help the Air District achieve its health-based PM<sub>2.5</sub> goals.

Background work and analysis done during the development of potential amendments to Rule 6-1 is intended to provide the foundation for the Air District's efforts to further reduce public exposure to unhealthy levels of particulate matter. Staff expects that additional, source-specific rulemaking will build upon this foundation.

Staff reviewed all stationary sources of particulate matter, and identified two additional opportunities to reduce particulate emissions under this rule. The first addresses particulates from Bulk Material Storage and Handling facilities:

- Requirements apply to bulk material sites with an Air District permit that produce, handle or use more than 10 tons per year of material, or store material more than 3 feet high.
- Prohibits significant visible emissions of fugitive dust from any source or activity that exceeds 10% opacity more than 3 minutes in any hour observation period.
- Prohibits any visible emissions of fugitive dust leaving the property.
- Requires prevention and cleanup of material spills.
- Visible emissions from sources within 1000 feet of the property line must be monitored twice daily.
- Visible emissions from all sources must be monitored daily.

Requirements for bulk material storage and handling have been incorporated into the amendments to Rule 6-1.

The second new opportunity to reduce particulate emissions under this rule addresses road dust originating from dirt and other solids that adhere to vehicles at construction sites, bulk material facilities, and other locations with disturbed surfaces. This material can get "tracked out" onto adjacent public roadways, pulverized into silt by subsequent traffic and entrained into the air creating a fugitive dust plume. Staff proposes draft new Regulation 6, Rule 6: Prohibition of Trackout:

- Requirements apply to large bulk material and construction sites, and disturbed surfaces greater than 1 acre.
- Prohibits trackout of dirt and other solids onto adjacent public roadways of more than 25 linear feet or 25 square feet for more than 4 hours.
- Prohibits more than 1 quart of remaining trackout at the end of each workday.
- Prevention of dust is required during cleanup of trackout.
- Trackout must be monitored mid-day and at the end of each workday.

A third opportunity to reduce smoke and particulate emissions from paving asphalt and roofing asphalt was found to be feasible, but emission reductions were so small as to be not cost-effective.

In addition, staff is proposing a new Regulation 6: General Provisions, Definitions and Test Methods Section to provide consistent administrative, monitoring and recordkeeping requirements; definitions; and test methods across all Regulation 6, Particulate Matter regulations.

The Air District conducted eight workshops in late January and early February (in conjunction with the 2017 Clean Air Plan Open Houses) to share details of the draft rules with the public and affected parties, and to seek input. The comment period closed on March 10, and staff is currently finalizing the proposal for a Public Hearing anticipated in February 2018.

#### BUDGET CONSIDERATIONS/FINANCIAL IMPACT

None.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Guy Gimlen  
Reviewed by: Greg Nudd

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT**

## Memorandum

To: Chairperson John Gioia and Members  
of the Stationary Source Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: December 18, 2017

Re: Regulation 11, Rule 18 Implementation Update

---

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

None; receive and file.

**BACKGROUND**

On November 15, 2017, the Air District Board of Directors adopted Regulation 11, Rule 18, Reduction of Risk from Air Toxic Emissions at Existing Facilities (Rule 11-18). Under this rule, facility-wide health risk assessments (HRAs) will be required for about 400 facilities in the Air District to determine the applicability of risk reduction requirements at existing facilities. In accordance with the Rule 11-18 Implementation Plan, the Air District plans to evaluate 60 facilities that are likely to have the highest health impacts during the first two years of implementation of this rule. These sites include refineries, cement manufacturing, metal melting, large chemical plants, large power plants, and landfills. The remaining 340 facilities will be evaluated during the latter years of the implementation plan.

**DISCUSSION**

In order to assist the Air District in performing these evaluations, staff issued a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) on November 10, 2016, to solicit qualifications from consulting firms that would be able to conduct facility-wide health risk assessments in support of the Air District's proposed risk reduction rule. The RFQ was forwarded to about 200 consultants, universities and was also posted on the Air District's website.

Questions regarding the RFQ were due on November 23, 2016. Answers to 18 questions were posted on December 1, 2016, and final responses to the RFQ were due on December 8, 2016. The Air District received proposals from twelve firms by the deadline.

**Evaluation of Proposals**

A panel, comprised of Engineering Division staff evaluated and scored the twelve proposals received based on the five evaluation criteria outlined in Table 1 below:

**Table 1. Evaluation Criteria for RFQ Proposals**

<b>Category</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Expertise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Number, complexity, and nature of HRA projects handled by the firm.</li> <li>• Selected firm’s staff ability, availability and facility for working with Air District staff</li> <li>• Quality and diversity of work product as demonstrated through submitted work samples.</li> <li>• Demonstrated knowledge of Air District activities and guidelines.</li> </ul>	40
Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Experience of firm and employees to be assigned to a District project in general, and, providing HRAs to governmental agencies.</li> </ul>	10
Approach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Approaches in methodology with respect to the anticipated scope of services that demonstrate maximum comprehension of and ability to provide such services.</li> </ul>	30
Cost	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proposed fee structure relating to services the firm(s) would provide.</li> </ul>	15
Other	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Minority-owned, veteran-owned, women-owned, Certified Green, or local business designations.</li> </ul>	5

The panel members’ scores for each criterion were averaged, and the twelve proposals were ranked according to the sum of these scores. Table 2 below lists the RFQ evaluation criteria and shows each firm’s averaged score by criteria.

**Table 2. Scores for RFQ Proposals**

<b>FIRM (by rank order)</b>	<b>Total (100 max)</b>	<b>Expertise (40 max)</b>	<b>Experience (10 max)</b>	<b>Approach (30 max)</b>	<b>Cost (15 max)</b>	<b>Other (5 max)</b>
Environmental Audit, Inc.	<b>88</b>	37	9	27	12	3
Ramboll Environ, Inc.	<b>86</b>	38	9	28	9	2
Environmental Science Associates	<b>86</b>	36	9	27	10	3
Trinity Consultants	<b>83</b>	36	9	26	9	2
ICF Resources	<b>78</b>	35	6	26	8	3
MRS Environmental, Inc.	<b>78</b>	34	8	26	8	1

<b>FIRM (by rank order)</b>	<b>Total (100 max)</b>	<b>Expertise (40 max)</b>	<b>Experience (10 max)</b>	<b>Approach (30 max)</b>	<b>Cost (15 max)</b>	<b>Other (5 max)</b>
EnviroComp Consulting, Inc.	<b>72</b>	35	7	20	7	2
Yorke Engineering, LLC	<b>65</b>	25	6	23	8	3
Ashworth Leininger Group	<b>61</b>	31	8	19	3	1
Placeworks	<b>53</b>	23	6	22	1	1
ES Engineering	<b>50</b>	19	5	18	8	0
Alta Environmental	<b>40</b>	23	3	11	3	1

Based on the scores in Table 2, staff is moving forward to contract with the top six firms identified so they can become Air District authorized health risk assessment vendors:

- Environment Audit, Inc.
- Ramboll Environ, Inc.
- Environmental Science Associates
- Trinity Consultants
- ICF Resources
- MRS Environmental, Inc.

Non-Title V facilities that prefer to contract directly with a consultant would be able to choose one of these consultants to conduct their facility-wide HRA instead of authorizing the Air District to conduct the HRA on their behalf.

### NEXT STEPS

Over the first quarter of 2018, the Air District will prepare the intake tools and data formats that facilities and consultants will use to update emission inventories and report air dispersion modeling parameters. The Air District will also refine the selection of the first twenty (20) high impact facilities that will undergo health risk assessment and notify these affected facilities. These facilities will be the first of the 60 High Impact Sites to begin the Rule 11-18 process.

As discussed during the Board Hearing, The Air District will also establish a Rule 11-18 Technical Dispute Resolution Committee to adjudicate emissions data, health risk assessment, or control technology disputes. The Air District will select members for this committee who will have expertise in the affected industries and health risk assessment. Control technology experts will be selected at a later date prior to implementation of the risk reduction phase of Rule 11-18.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

All contracts will be no cost contracts; the costs of HRA services will be recovered by fees charged to the affected facilities.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent  
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Carol Allen and Sanjeev Kamboj  
Reviewed by: Damian Breen